Contents

Summary **v**

Acknowledgments **vii**

Table of Contents **ix**

List of Figures **xiii**

List of Tables **xv**

1 Introduction **1**
1.1 Courts as Political Actors 2
1.2 Studying Separate Opinions 4
1.3 The Necessity of New Approaches 5
1.3.1 Theories of Judicial Decision-Making 5
1.3.2 Deficiencies of the Theories 10
1.4 A Novel Study 15
1.5 Innovations 16

2 The Constitutional Court Database **19**
2.1 Premises and Conceptual Development 19
2.1.1 Conceptualization 21
2.1.2 Purpose 21

2.1.3 What Data and Where to Find it . . . 23
2.1.4 Structural Demands . . . 26
2.1.5 Technical Realization . . . 30
2.1.6 Collection Process . . . 31
2.2 From a Decision to Variables . . . 34
2.2.1 Actors . . . 35
2.2.2 Subject . . . 36
2.2.3 Legal Concepts . . . 37
2.2.4 Essential Content . . . 38
2.2.5 Key Facts . . . 39
2.3 Variables in the Database . . . 40
2.3.1 Case Level . . . 41
2.3.2 Proceeding Level . . . 47
2.3.3 Concluding Remarks . . . 54

3 Separate Opinions **57**
3.1 Separate Opinions in an International Perspective . . . 60
3.2 Separate Opinions in Germany . . . 61
3.3 Existing Research . . . 64

4 Theory **71**
4.1 Individual Costs and Benefits of Separate Opinions . . . 71
4.2 A New Approach . . . 73
4.2.1 Norm of Consensus . . . 74
4.2.2 Utilities of Norm Adherence . . . 75
4.2.3 Norm-Identification . . . 77
4.2.4 Level of Disagreement . . . 82
4.3 The Identification-Disagreement Model . . . 84
4.4 Hypotheses . . . 87

5 Empirics **93**
5.1 Data Set and Case Selection . . . 93
5.2 Operationalization . . . 98
5.2.1 Dependent Variable: A Judge's Vote . . . 99
5.2.2 Explanatory Variables . . . 99
5.2.3 Control Variables . . . 106
5.2.4 Descriptive Statistics . . . 110
5.3 Methods and Estimation Strategy . . . 114

5.4 Results . . . 117
5.4.1 Hypothesis 1: Potential for Disagreement . . . 120
5.4.2 Hypothesis 2: Norm-Identification . . . 122
5.4.3 Hypothesis 3: Differences between Professions in Controversial and Uncontroversial Cases . . . 124
5.4.4 Hypotheses 4a & 4b: Types of Separate Opinions . . . 126
5.4.5 Hypothesis 5: Time and Norm-Identification . . . 128

6 Conclusion **131**
6.1 Scientific Contributions . . . 132
6.1.1 Building a Database . . . 132
6.1.2 A New Theoretical Framework . . . 133
6.1.3 Separate Opinions at the FCC . . . 134
6.2 Implications for Further Research . . . 135
6.3 Outlook on Future Research . . . 136

Bibliography **139**

Appendices **153**

A Separate Opinions **153**

B Empirics **157**
B.1 Correlations . . . 157
B.2 Effect of Controversy at Mean of *Paragraphs* . . . 159
B.3 Proportions of Vote Types . . . 159
B.4 Proportional Odds Assumption . . . 160
B.5 Robustness Checks . . . 160
B.6 Variable Names . . . 160